

Sub. : Complaint of Smt. Nanda Rudra, one of the HHWs regarding selection of FTS at Bongaon Municipality under CBPHCS.

The complaint letter of Smt. Nanda Rudra, HHW, Bongaon Municipality under CBPHC regarding irregularity in selection of FTSS was forwarded to the Chairman, Bongaon Municipality under this office memo no. SUDA-Health/63 ULBs/08/124 dt. 30.06.2008 for obtaining views of BOC in this regard.

* CP-①

The Chairman, Bongaon Municipality vide their memo no. B.M. 1008 dt. 16.10.2008 has forwarded a copy of the proceedings of the meeting of the BOC held on 18.09.2008. From the proceedings it is seen that BOC has recommended the names of the 7 HHWs who have been selected as FTSS through written test & interview where representative of SUDA was also present. BOC has further recommended that SUDA may be requested for according approval to the engagement of the FTSS so selected.

* CP-②

In this connection it may be mentioned that the selected 7 FTSS have already completed their job placement training at SUDA during 23 to 27 June, 2008 and the issuance of letter of engagement of the FTSS has been held up for the time being till receipt views of BOC.

In view of all above, decision may kindly be given whether we would accord approval to the Chairman, Bongaon Municipality for engagement of the selected FTSS who have already completed their training.

O.O. NO SUDA -
63 ULBs / 08/21/
70 84 - 5 - 11-08
Director, SUDA

Submitted.

Goswami
05.11.08

Recruitment qualification of FTS & mode of selection may pl. be stated.

Thin
06/11/08

PO (H)

This office communication bearing no. SUDA - Health / 63 ULBs / 07 / 591 (44) dt. 12.12.2007 on the subject of guideline for selection of FTS, is enclosed. Recruitment - Qualification may be seen at pg. ① marked "A" and mode of selection at pg. ② marked "B".

C:\Dr. Goswami\RCH-63 ULBs\Notesheet.doc

Submitted.

Goswami
06.11.08

It has been pointed out by the complainant that class VIII pass candidates were

considered for selection while
the prescribed minimum qualification
was Madhyamik pass. If that be so,
how class VIII pass candidates
were considered for selection? Let
us discuss.

Chinn
4/11/08

~~PO(H)~~

Draft letter is enclosed for signature,
if approved.

~~PO(H)~~
1.12.08

~~PO(H)~~

Necessary correction made,
submitted for signature.

Chinn
4/12/08

~~PO(H)~~
05.12.08

~~PO(H)~~

Despatched.

Chinn
05/12/08

~~PO(H)~~
8.12.08

Placed herewith the communication of the Chairman, Bongaon Municipality bearing no. B.M.1214 dt. 22.12.08 in reply to our communication no.SUDA-63ULBs/23/08/316 dt. 01.12.2008.

Summary of the documents submitted by the Chairman is as under:

<p>Document 1-</p> <p>Minutes of the HHW's meeting on 08.04.08 held by Smt. Ratna Halder, Councillor and President, Education & Health Standing Committee, other staff of M & S Cell, and 32 HHWs including the complainant</p>	<p>Though decision taken by the Committee towards preparation of primary list of candidature for FTS @ 2 per Sub-centre (total 14 nos.), but additional selection of 4 HHWs for FTS is not clear. The name of the complainant i.e Smt. Nanda Rudra was also included in the selected list.</p> <p>However, this additional 4 nos. of HHWs were not selected finally by MHFWC</p>
<p>Document 2-</p> <p>Minutes of the MHFWC held on 09.04.2008</p>	<p>The above mentioned primarily selected list was vetted</p>
<p>Document 3-</p> <p>Minutes of the MHFWC held on 25.04.2008</p> <p>Compiled Score sheet of the 18 candidates signed by the Chairman, Bongaon Mpl., MO, ACMOH, Supdt. Of Hospital and Dr.G.De, Medical Specialist, SUDA</p>	<p>On the basis of score (both written & viva) the MHFWC selected the first seven candidates. None was selected for SC no.3. The complainant stood 17th rank amongst the 18 candidates.</p>
<p>Document 4-</p> <p>Communication of the Chairman, Bongaon Mpl. Bearing no. B.M 1214 dt. 22.12.08</p>	<p>It reveals from his communication that as there were no Madhyamik pass candidates available in SC no.7, 2 HHWs (Class VIII pass) i.e Smt. Mallika Das and Smt. Mousumi Pal were primarily selected by standing Committee. These two candidates have secured highest marks (total 3 candidates secured highest marks)</p>

All the selected FTSs have been already trained during 23-27 June, 2008 at SUDA. Issuance of order for their engagement has been held due to complaint lodged by Nanda Rudra, HHW received by this office on 25.06.08.

Now in view of the clarification submitted by the Chairman, advice may kindly be given next course of action.

Submitted.

[Signature]
29.12.08

U.O. No. SUDA/63/028)
21(PT-III)/00/
10484. 29.12.08
Director SUDA
PO(A) / Dr. Jay
we may
discuss
06/01/09
02/01/09

Discussed on date.
Draft letter is enclosed for signature, if approved.

[Signature]
07.01.09

U. Nanda
7/1/09

Despatched

[Signature]
12.01.09.

Director, SUDA
PO(A)

Placed herewith communication of the Chairman, Bongaon Municipality bearing no. BM 120 dt. 03.02.2009 (at Flag - A) along with enclosures in response to this office letter no. SUDA-Health/52(Pt. I)/08/374 dt. 07.01.2009. The said enclosures are as under :

- Order bearing no BM 64 dt. 14.01.2009 for engagement of 05 nos. of FTSs at Flag - B.
- Order bearing no BM 63 dt. 14.01.2009 for engagement of 06 nos. of HHWs at Flag - C. (Additional one HHW has been engaged in the vacancy caused due to resignation of regular HHW).
- Mark sheet of Smt. Mousumi Pal, trainee FTS at Flag - D.
- Pass / Character Certificate of Smt. Mallika Das (Biswas), trainee FTS at Flag-E.
- Copy of minutes of MHFWC held on 17.01.2009 at Flag - F.

MHFWC, Bongaon Municipality has re-examined the candidature of two trainee FTSs namely Smt. Mousumi Pal and Smt. Mallika Das in respect of their educational qualification and documented the following in the minutes of MHFWC meeting held on 17.01.2009.

- Smt. Mousumi Pal appeared in Madhyamik Pariksha and got compartmental in history. Copy of Mark sheet at - D.
- Smt. Mallika Das has passed Class - VIII. Copy of certificate is enclosed at - E.

It is also seen from the minutes of the meeting that both the trainee FTSs secured full marks in written & oral test though they are not Madhyamik Pass. This is to mention here that these two FTS candidates have undergone training at SUDA but their engagement was held up after receipt of complaint in respect of their educational qualification.

In view of all above, necessary advice in respect of engagement of those two candidates in the post of FTS may kindly be granted.

He may seek legal advice through the Deptt. to avoid any court case in future. Statement of facts along with supporting papers be prepared please.

Director, SUDA

Goswami
24.3.09

PO(H)

Vinod
27/3/09

Instruction at pre-page
 Statement of facts along with supporting
 documents are placed in the File no.
 SUDA - Health / 52 (Pt. 11) / 08, which
 may be sent to the Dept. for
 obtaining legal views whether
 under the stated circumstances
 approval can be accorded for
 engagement of the two ~~complaints~~
 trainee FTS candidates under
 comp. cam by Smt. Nanda Rudra.
 Submitted.

~~Director, SUDA~~

~~g. S. Ram~~
01.04.09

File no. SUDA - Health / 52 (Pt. 11) / 08
 has been sent to the Jt. Secy., H.A. Deptt.
 along with necessary notes.

~~PO(H)~~

Union

~~g. S. Ram~~
23.06.09.

Placed below is a complaint letter dated 10.08.2009 (Flag - A) from Smt. Nanda Rudra, addressed to the Chairman, Bongaon Municipality with copy endorsed to the Director, SUDA among others, the letter will speak for itself.

This is to mention here that in the meantime, a communication from the Chairman, Bongaon Municipality bearing no. BM-807 dt. 06.08.2009 (Flag - B) has been received on 07.08.2009 intimating termination of the services of Smt. Nanda Rudra on and from 06.08.2009 due to negligence in her duties and misbehaviour with people of working place. It is seen from the said letter that MHFWC has resolved to terminate the services of Smt. Rudra and it has been unanimously ratified by BOC.

Smt. Nanda Rudra in her letter dt. 10.08.2009 has raised some allegations and also stated that without giving her any chance of self defence her services have been terminated. She has appealed to the Chairman, Gobardanga Municipality for taking necessary action for allowing her to work after cancellation of the said order of termination of her services.

In view of all above, shall we obtain views of the Chairman with regard to the allegation points raised by Smt. Nanda Rudra.

Submitted.

~~Director SUDA~~
~~PO(H)~~
Pl. Shins.
4/9/09

~~Goswami~~
03.09.09

Discussed .
Complaint letter along with enclosures
may be sent to the chairman.
Draft letter is enclosed for signature,
if approved.
Submitted

~~Director SUDA~~
~~PO(H)~~

~~Goswami~~
17.09.09
Chinn
24/9/09

Amended letter is placed for signature pl.

~~PO(H)~~

~~Goswami~~
22.09.09
Chinn
24/9/09

Ref. NSP - 6.

Placed here with comm. of the Jt. Secy. Dept. of MA bearing no. 594/MA/C-10/25-26/2008 dt. 27. August, 2009 in response to our File no. SUDA-Health/52(PT-11)/08.

It may be seen from the letter of Jt. Secy, MAD that approval not to be accorded by SUDA for the two candidates under dispute for the post of FTS.

"A" [shall we inform this to the ULB? Submitted for kind advice.

Director, SUDA

P.C. Ghosh
7/10/09

15.10.09
Dr. D.C.

Dr. S. S. Ghosh
06.10.09

Discussed.

Explanation in respect of selection of FTS under CBPHE, Bongaon Mpl. Submitted by Dr. G. D. C, APO is enclosed for kind perusal.

Submitted for further advice, particularly in respect of 'A' as marked above.

Director, SUDA

Dr. S. S. Ghosh
05.11.09

See. Hereafter all documents should be checked by the representative of SUDA while attending such meeting of selection committees to avoid future complications. We may inform our stand to the ULB with adequate background.

Dr. S. S. Ghosh
2/11/09

PO(H)

Instruction ab- NSP-8.
Draft letter is enclosed for signature if approved.

~~Director SUDA~~
~~PO(H)~~
~~Director SUDA~~
~~PO(H)~~

~~S. S. Ghoshal~~
10.11.09

Chir
13/11/09

Corrected copy submitted for signature.

~~S. S. Ghoshal~~
16.11.09

Chir
14/11/09

~~S. S. Ghoshal~~

Placed herewith comm. of Smt. Nanda Rudra dt. 21.12.09 addressed to the Secretary, Dept. of MA. In this regard NSP-7 is referred to to summarize:-

- Intimation letter of the chairman, Bongaon Mpl vide no. BM-807 dt. 06.08.09 at Flag-A in connection with termination of services of Smt Nanda Rudra due negligence of duties and mis behaviour.
- Complaint letter of Smt. Rudra dt. 10.8.09 addressed to the chairman, Bongaon Mpl with copy to Director, SUDA amongst others. The complaint was dismissed of her service on and from 06.08.09
- Director SUDA forwarded the said complaint to the chairman vide This office memo no SUDA-Health/54/08/381 dt. 17.09.09 with the

request to send an Action taken Report.

- We are yet to receive response from the chairman.

Submitted for advice.

Director, SUDA

0522mm
06.01.10

Let us obtain report of the Committee constituted by the ULB to enquire ~~into~~ into the allegations against Smt. Rudra, copy of the minutes of H&F Committee regarding acceptance of the Committee's report and resolution of Board approving dismissal of Smt. Rudra.

Chin
9/1/10

PO (H)

Draft letter is enclosed for signature, if approved

0322mm
11.01.10

PO (H)

Chin
12/1/10

Despatched.

0522mm
12.1.10

Placed here with comm. of the chairman, Buregan Mpl. bearing memo no. BM 16 dt - 08.01.10 suggesting for grant of approval towards reinstatement of Smt. NANDA Rudra who was sacked by the ULB w.e.f 06.08.2009. As chairman of the ULB is appointing authority after selection by MAFWC and ratification by BDC, the ULB is to decide on the issue of reinstatement, where SUDA has no role.

Draft letter is enclosed for signature, if approved

Despatched.

Director, SUDA

0522mm
25/1/10
Chin

Placed herewith HP No 8862 (4) of 2010 in the matter of Smt. Nanda Reda, H/W of Bongraon mpe, writ petitioners vs. the state of West Bengal & others (Respondent), forwarded by Lt. Advocate Sri Somnath Roy choudhury, received by me ups on date (afternoon). In the said communication, it is stated that the application will come up for hearing before the Hon'ble Justice Sri Tapen Sen on May 3, 2010 or soon thereafter.

May we refer this case to the Dept. for taking further necessary legal action?
Submitted for kind advice.

Director, SUDA

S. S. S. S. S.
03.05.10

Dept. be requested to engage a lawyer to defend SUDA. Meanwhile SOF be prepared.

Yours
3/5/10

PO (H)

Draft letter is enclosed herewith for signature, if approved. SOF along with enclosure and writ petition are also enclosed which may be sent to the Dept.

S. S. S. S. S.
05.05.10

Yours
5/5/10

Director, SUDA

PO (H)

Despatched thro office of SUDA.

S. S. S. S. S.
6/5/10