

Sub. : Complaint regarding selection of personnel in respect of M & S Cell at Basirhat Municipality under CBPHC.

Smt. Krishna Majumder, Ex. Vice-Chairman and Standing Councillor, Basirhat Municipality in her communication dt. 19.03.2008 complained that the Selection Committee was not constituted as per guideline of SUDA in respect of selection personnel at M & S Cell under CBPHC.

On scrutiny, the processes undertaken by the ULB in respect of the said selection are as under :

Letter No. & Date	Process / Activity	Remarks
ULB Letter no. 2212(4) dt. 16.01.2008 -C/P-(1)	Forwarded a copy of notice to Director, SUDA for her information with regard to selection & contractual appointment of personnel at M & S Cell.	Last date for receipt for such applications for 5 nos. of posts was within 24.01.2008 upto 2 p.m.
ULB Letter no. 2433 dt. 01.02.2008 -C/P-(2)	Intimating date of interview for such selection on 07.02.2008 at 11 a.m. with cop to other members of MHFWC i.e. rep. of DM, Sub-Divisional of MO, ANMOH, CIC, Health, NHO rep. and president of CDS.	Shri Tarak Dutta was detailed as representative of SUDA.
ULB Letter no. 2677(7) dt. 29.02.2008 -C/P-(3)	Intimating MHFWC members to be present in its meeting to be held on 12.03.2008 for contractual staff selection at M & S Cell.	Since the selection was already over and the meeting was routine one, any SUDA representative was not detailed.
ULB Letter no. 2795(3) - 2799(3) dt. 14.03.2008 -C/P-(4)	The Chairman issued appointment letter to each of the 5 persons separately for joining in the post within 7 days from the date of receipt of said letter.	Copy forwarded to Director, SUDA for information.
Complaint of Smt. Krishna Majumder dt. 19.03.2008 -C/P-(5)	The complaint was that the Selection Committee (MHFWC) was not constituted as per guideline of SUDA.	As per guideline of SUDA the MHFWC (who is responsible for selection) constitutes as under : Chairman, of the ULB - Chairman CIC, Health - Member Rep. of DM - Member Rep. of NGO - Member ACMOH - Member HO, of ULB - Member Secretary President, CDS - Member Rep. of SUDA - Co-opted Member Supdt. of Govt. Hospital - Invitee Member A copy of communication of SUDA dt. 06.06.2006 is enclosed. -C/P-(6)

Letter No. & Date	Process / Activity	Remarks
SUDA Letter No. 769 dt. 25.03.2008 -C/P-(7)	On receipt of complaint letter the Chairman was requested to submit the name and designation of Selection Committee members including invitee, if any, and to held up engagement of those personnel till further communication from this end.	
ULB letter no. 23 dt. 03.04.2008 -C/P-(8)	The Chairman informed that the following members of MHFWC were present during selection : Chairman representative Shri Dipak Ghosh – Member, CIC Sub-Div. MO, ACMOH, The rep. of SUDA Md. Liyakat Ali, NGO Kajali Roy, CDS Sk. Sahidulla, CIC, Health	It is observed that the Chairman was not present during selection. It is not clear whether it is in order that member – CIC can represent Chairman at Selection Committee. The Chairman confirmed that the selected personnel already joined in the post with effect from 18.03.2008 before receipt of this office letter dt. 25.03.2008.

Submitted for necessary instruction.

Director SUDA

Goswami
24.04.08

Pl. request the chairman to let us know ^{as to} under what circumstance CIC has nominated to represent the chairman.

PO(H)

Chief
29/4/08

Draft letter ~~is~~ is enclosed for signature, if approved.

Goswami
28.4.08

Chief
29/4/08

Director SUDA
PO(H)

Goswami

Enclosed the communication of the chairman, Basirhat Municipality bearing no. 130 dt. 05.05.2008 in reply to our query.

The chairman informed that Sri Deepak Ghosh, Councillor - In-charge (PUD) represented him as the chairman had to attend Assembly Committee, WBZA held on the date of interview i.e. 07.02.2008, for selection of personnel under Mas cell of CBPIHC.

In view of the clarification forwarded by the Chairman, as above, a decision is to be taken whether the constitution of Selection Committee is in order or not.

Submitted for further instruction.

[Signature]
25.5.08

Director, SUDA

From prepage of above.

Smt. Krishna Hegmdar, Councillor of Basirhat Municipality, has alleged that (selection of) personnel of Municipal level H & S Cell at Basirhat has been made by a Committee not constituted as per go. It appears that Chairman of the Municipality, who is the President of the Committee, could not attend due to his preoccupation in the Assembly as MCA, Basirhat and he authorized Dipak Ghosh, Member, CIC to represent him. Among other members MCA's representative did not attend

Flag A

and there is no H.O. in the
 municipality. Other members of the
 Committee as mentioned in Govt.
 guideline attended the meeting.
 SUDA was represented by Shri T.C. Dutta,
 Programme Coordinator, SUDA. Hence
 the only departure from guidelines
 is that the Chairman of the municipality
 could not attend, the reason for
 which has been justified by him. It
 may be agreed that the selection
 procedure cannot be initiated only
 for this purpose. Secondly on receipt
 of the complaint on 19.3.08 over Fax,
 the Chairman was requested to hold
 up the engagement of selected
 personnel till further communication
 from SUDA. But it has been reported
 by the Chairman that the selected
 persons had since joined their
 respective posts w.e.f. 18.3.08 and
 have been discharging their duties.
 In view of the above, it
 may be concluded that there is no
~~complaint~~ sufficient ground to
 cancel the selection of
 personnel by the committee and
 the matter be dropped.



U.O. No. SUDA/67/2006/25
 20.5.08

Pr. Secretary
 H.W. Deptt.
 &
 Chairman, SUDA

PO(H)
 Pr. Secy
 21/5/08
 21/5/08
 21/5/08
 21/5/08

Chief
 19/5/08

Instruction at pg-4.

Draft letter is checked for signature, it approved.

~~Director, SV-08~~

~~pp(H)~~

~~Asst. Commr.~~
28-5-08.

Chief
26/5/08

Signed letter sent
and speed post

through FAX

~~Asst. Commr.~~
29-5-08

Sub. : Complaint of Smt. Rubi Mitra with regard to irregular appointment of manpower at M & S Cell, Basirhat Municipality under Community Based Primary Health Care Services.

Enclosed the copy of communication of PS to MIC, MA & UD Dept. bearing no. 248/PS/2008 dt. 12.06.2008 along with complaint letter lodged by Smt. Rubi Mitra. In this connection it is to mention here that the Dept. had issued order bearing no. 111/MA/C-10/3S-55/2005 dt. 02.02.2007 towards contractual appointment of staff under CBPHC wherein Municipal Level Health & Family Welfare Committee was vested with the responsibility for selection of the candidates.

The complaints of Smt. Mitra are (a) Notification for receipt of applications were displayed in few notice boards, not routed through Employment Exchange or insertion in leading newspapers, (b) No written test was held, (c) Though Smt. Krishna Majumder, Ex. Vice-Chairperson and Standing Councillor, Basirhat Municipality lodged a complaint, the manpower engaged were paid out of the fund for honorarium of Health workers in absence of approval of the Authority.

In respect of (a) & (b) it is to state that no specific guideline for selection process was issued by the Dept. and Municipal Level Health & Family Welfare Committee (MHFWC) was given the full responsibility for selection. Actually what selection process was adopted by MHFWC is not known to us. In that case shall we request DLB to depute one Officer to make local query and submit a report. With regard to (c) above it is stated that there was no sufficient ground found to cancel the selection of the personnel by the Committee and the matter was dropped. Accordingly the ULB was informed. Copies of Note sheet in respect of complaints lodged by Smt. Krishna Majumder and our reply bearing no. SUDA-Health/63 ULBs/08/66 dt. May 28, 2008 are enclosed.

Submitted.

[Signature]
19.06.08

Dr. Ganga Dey may pl. submit a report on the issues raised by the complainant.

[Signature]
20/7/08

Visited Basirhat on 14.7.08 for the purpose of collection of information regarding the above issue. Report submitted.
16.7.08

*cp-①

**cp-②

① cp-③

U.O No. SUDA-Health
08/23
19-06-08.
Director, SUDA

Dr. Dey
[Signature]

Sub. : Enquiry report regarding selection of personnel in respect of M&S Cell at Basirhat Municipality under CBPHC.

Visited Basirhat Municipality on 14.07.2008.

All available documents were collected and enclosed herewith.

SN	Complaints	Observations
1	Notification for receipt of application were displayed in few notice boards, not routed through Employment exchange or leading Newspapers.	Notification receipt of application were displayed on Notice Board. Copy of the notice collected & enclosed. Notification was not done through Employment Exchange or Newspaper advertisement Annexure No. 1 - Copy of the Notice
2	No written test was held for selection.	Decision regarding written examination was not taken by MHFWC members during the Selection Committee meeting. Conduction of such written test is mandatory was not given in SUDA guideline. Score sheet of the viva examination duly signed by all the Selection Committee members were collected and enclosed herewith. As per guidelines of SUDA the MHFWC members present during the interview (Selection Committee): Rep. of Chairman, of the ULB CIC, Health Rep. of NGO ACMOH Rep. of CDS Rep. of SUDA Rep. of Supdt. of Govt. Hospital Annexure No. 2 - Score Sheets
3	Inspite of complaint lodged regarding the selection process, the manpower engaged were paid out of the fund for honorarium of health workers in the absence of approval of the authority	The above personnel of M&S Cell were engaged since 18.03.2008 but their honorarium was withheld due to complaint lodged by the applicant. After verification, no sufficient ground was found to cancel the selection, the matter was dropped and ULB was informed. Honorarium along with arrears were paid after they received our letter on 28.05.08. (Memo no. SUDA-Health/63ULB/08/06) Annexure No. 3- No objection letter from SUDA

Gangsi De
Med Specialist
SUDA
Signature

Date - 21. 07. 08

PO (Health)

NOTES of Dr. DC at pg 2.
NOTES are self explanatory.
Submitted for kind instructions.

Director, SVDOR

J.S. Dasgupta
22.07.08

Perused the report. As per memo. no. 111 - H.A./C-10/35-55/2005 dt 02.2.07 of H.A. Dept., selection of personnel is to be made through H.A./FW Committee of the URB concerned. Selection process also includes mode of manner of circulating the vacancy(s). So let us ascertain as to whether any such decision was taken by the ^{said} Committee or the decision was taken by the chairman himself.

Urim
23/7/08

PO(H)

Draft letter is placed hereon for signature, if approved.

J.S. Dasgupta
30.7.08

Urim
01/8/08

AO(H)

Forwarded on 4.8.08